

---

## JUSTIFICATION STATEMENT FOR CONTRACT AWARD

---

**University of Utah**

**North Physics Building No. 83 Roofing Improvements**

**DFCM Project No. 02127750**

---

The University of Utah selection committee was very impressed with each of the contractors and expresses its appreciation to them for their efforts and interest in the project.

The committee resolved to rank Layton Roofing (Layton) the firm that provides the best value to the State of Utah due to the following:

- Layton paid close attention to detail and demonstrated knowledge of the project and what it would take to be successful;
- Layton's approach to the lower roof level was impressive;
- Layton's approach to attachment of the insulation was impressive – they demonstrated clear knowledge of the concerns with the lightweight concrete and addressed them well; and
- Layton's cost proposal was very competitive – they were the second lowest bidder.

### Final Ranking

1. E
2. S
3. T
4. U

# VBS Selection Final Scoring Matrix

University of Utah  
North Physics Building No. 83 Roofing Improvements  
DFCM Project No. 02127750

29 April 2003

Selection Criteria	U			T			E			S		
Past Performance Rating	4	4	3.5	3	3	3	4	4.5	4	5	5	5
Strength of Team	4.5	5	4	3.5	2	3	5	5	3	4	4	2
Project Management Approach	4	5	3.5	3	2	2	5	5	3	2	3	4
Schedule	5	5	5	3.5	2	3	5	5	4	4	5	4
Performance History of Proposed Roofing Membrane	3.5	3	1	3.5	3	1	5	5	5	3.5	5	1
Durability and Puncture Resistance of Roofing Membrane	5	4	4	3.5	4	4	5	5	5	2.5	4	3
Contractor's Project Safety Plan	3.5	4	4	3	3	2	4	4	3	3	4	2

**DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES  
DIVISION OF FACILITIES CONSTRUCTION AND MANAGEMENT**

**VALUE BASED SELECTION**

PROPOSALS COVERING:

DATE: April 17, 2003

**NORTH PHYSICS #083 ROOFING IMPROVEMENTS**  
**UNIVERSITY OF UTAH**  
**SALT LAKE CITY, UTAH**

DFCM Project No: 02127750  
Construction Budget: \$160,000

CONTRACTOR	BID SEC	ADD RECD	BASE BID	SUBLIST RECD	COMPL DATE
U	BB	1	193,565	Yes	8/1/03
T	BB	1	\$157,650	Yes	7/30/03
E	BB	1	153,690	Yes	8/31/03
S	BB	1	153,500	Yes	7/30/03

I hereby certify this to be a true and exact  
tabulation of proposals received for the above named  
project on April 17, 2003 at 4:00 p.m.

---

Susan L. Smith  
Contract Coordinator